科研基盤研究(B)「トランスアトランティック・エコロジー」公開セミナー(2016 年 8 月 5 日、専修大学神田キャンパス)

川津雅江 (mkawatsu@nagoya-ku.ac.jp)

### 1. スコット・スロヴィックのいうエコクリティシズムの流れ

第一波 1980s~

nonfiction "nature writing"; no-human nature wilderness and experience; American and British literature; and "discursive" ecofeminism (that is, the idea that women and the rest of nature share a special bond)

第二派 mid-1990s~

the study of multiple literary genres and the development of "green cultural studies"

an attention to the artistic representation of environmental conditions and experiences of various cultural groups around the world; environmental justice ecocriticism; a new attention to urban and suburban experience 第三波 2009~

global concepts of place, neo-bioregionalist attachments to specific locales; questions about the possibility of post-national and post-ethnic visions of human experience of the environment, while some consider the importance of retaining ethnic identities but placing ethnically inflected experience in broader, comparative contexts; ; "<u>material</u>" <u>ecofeminism</u>, eco-masculinism; "animality"; "critiques from within"; a "polymorphously activist" 第四派 2012~

"material ecocriticism"

#### 2. 女性と自然(動物)

- ・リベラル・フェミニズム 女性≠自然(動物)
- ・社会構築派
- ・エコフェミニズム (late 1970s-1980s)

女性=自然(動物)、男性=文化によって支配・搾取される。

Susan Griffin, Women and Nature (1978)

Mary Daly, *Gyn/Ecology* (1978)

Carolyn Merchant, The Death of Nature (1980)

Leonie Caldecott and Stephanie Leland, eds, Reclaim the Earth: Women Speak Out for Life on Earth (1983)

女性≠自然 (動物)

# Î

#### essentialism

・ポストモダン・フェミニズム(1990s~)

(男性/女性、文化/自然、精神/身体、理性/感情など)二元論の脱構築、女性≠自然(動物)言説偏重、経験無視、理論、現況批判

## 3. エコフェミニズム (1990s)

経験重視、多様性,実践、未来志向

Judith Plant, ed. Healing the Wounds: The Promise of Ecofeminism (1989)

Jane Diamond and Gloria Orenstein, eds, *Reweaving the World: The Emergence of Ecofeminism* (1990) Greta Gaard, ed., *Ecofeminism: Women, Animals, Nature* (1993)

#### ① エコフェミニズムの基本的原理

Ecofeminist principles are based on the following beliefs:

1. The building of Western industrial civilization in opposition to nature interacts dialectically with and reinforces the subjugation of women, because women are believed to be closer to nature. Therefore, ecofeminists take on the life-struggles of all of nature as our own.

2. <u>Life on earth is an interconnected web, not a hierarchy</u>. There is no natural hierarchy; human hierarchy is projected onto nature and then used to justify social domination...

3. A healthy, balanced ecosystem, including human and nonhuman inhabitants, must maintain diversity.... Therefore we need a decentralized global movement that is founded on common interests yet <u>celebrates</u> diversity and opposes all forms of domination and violence....

4. <u>The survival of the species necessitates a renewed understanding of our relationship to nature, of our own</u> bodily nature, and of nonhuman nature around us; it necessitates <u>a challenging of the nature-culture dualism</u> and a corresponding radical restructuring of human society according to feminist and ecological principles.... (King19-20)

## ② 生物学的文化的多様性, 主体・歴史の作り手としての女性

Ecofeminist politics does not stop short at the phase of dismantling the androcentric and anthropocentric biases of Western civilization. . . . eco-feminism seeks to reweave new stories that acknowledge and value the bio-logical and cultural diversity that sustains all life. These new stories honor, rather than fear, women's biological particularity while simultaneously affirming women as subjects and makers of history. This understanding that biological particularity need not be antithetical to historical agency is crucial to the transformation of feminism. (Diamond and Orenstein xi) ③ すべての抑圧の撤廃、自然/文化の二元論を拒絶

Ecofeminism is a theory that has evolved from various fields of feminist inquiry and activism: peace movements, labor movements, women's health care, and the anti-nuclear, environmental, and animal liberation movements. Drawing on the insights of ecology, feminism, and socialism, ecofeminism's basic premise is that the ideology which authorizes oppressions such as those based on race, class, gender, sexuality, physical abilities, and species is the same ideology which sanctions the oppression of nature. Ecofeminism call for an end to all oppressions, arguing that no attempt to liberate women (or any other oppressed group) will be successful without an equal attempt to liberate nature. Its theoretical base is a sense of self most commonly expressed by women and various other nondominant groups—a self that is interconnected with all life. (Gaard, "Living Interconnections" 1)

The contributors to this volume reject the nature/culture dualism of patriarchal thought, and locate animals and humans within nature. (Gaard, "Living Interconnections" 6)

④ 活動的な主体

[E] cofeminists have perhaps been most insistent on some version of the world as active subject, not as resource to be mapped and appropriated in bourgeois, Marxist, or masculininst projects. (Haraway, *Simians* 199) (5)  $\pm -\vec{y}_{\pm} \neq \vec{y}_{\pm}$ 

[I]n a sociological account of science <u>all sorts of things are actors</u>, only some of which are human language-bearing actors, and ... you have to include, as sociological actors, all kinds of heterogeneous entities...<u>this imperative helps to break down the notion that only the language-bearing actors have a kind of agency</u>. (Penley and Ross 5) ⑥ 「我々と別の人・モノ」、異階層 That is to say, beings who are neither Self nor Other in any absolute dichotomy but are familiar, related to, and connected with us. Rather than *self* and *other*, then, it would be more accurate to speak of *we* and *another*....such a notion of *another* is consistent with the ecofeminist ideas of healthy biological diversity and life as an interconnected web, as a heterarchy rather than a hierarchy. (Murphy, "Ecofeminism" 51)

<u>Anotherness proceeds from a heterarchical sense of difference</u>, recognizing that we are not ever only one for ourselves but are also always another for others....Otherness isolated from anotherness suppresses knowledge of the ecological processes of interdependency—the ways in which humans and other entities survive, change, and learn by continuously mutually influencing each other—and denies nay ethics of reciprocity. (Murphy, *Literature* 152). ⑦ 未来志向

But in contrast to postmodernism, which many see as locked in a negative critique of the present that may actually contribute to the extension of the postmodern moment, <u>ecofeminism focuses on the future</u>. (Murphy, "Ecofeminism" 41-42)

## 4. マテリアル・フェミニズム

Stacy Alaimo and Susan Hekman, eds. Material Feminisms (2008)

## ・ポストモダン・フェミニズムの言語偏重批判

Although postmoderns claims to reject all dichotomies, there is one dichotomy that they appear to embrace almost without question: language/reality. Whereas the epistemology of modernism is grounded in objective access to a real/natural world, postmodernists argue that the real/material is entirely constituted by language; what we call the real is a product of language and has its reality only in language. (Alaimo and Hekman, "Introduction" 2)

- ・「言説の傾向」から「マテリアルの傾向」へ
- マテリアリスト・フェミニズムとの違い

Rosemary Hennessy and Chrys Ingraham, eds., *Materialist Feminism: A Reader in Class, Difference, and Women's Lives* (1997)

・マテリアル・フェミニズムへの影響

←新しいエコフェミニズム

- ←新しいフェミニスト科学批評
  - Sandra Harding, Helen Longino, Lorraine Code, and Lynne Hankinson Nelson 新経験論
  - Bruno Latour, Andrew Pickering 存在論
  - ・Donna Haraway, Karen Barad エージェント論

・マテリアル・フェミニズムの特徴

① 受動的な沈黙の自然からエージェントとしての自然へ

They [feminists] are developing theories in which nature is more than a passive social construction but is, rather, <u>an</u> <u>agentic force</u> that interacts with and changes the other elements in the mix, including the human. (Alaimo and Hekman, "Introduction" 7)

Nature, as understood by material feminism, is rarely a blank, silent resources for the exploits of culture. Nor is it the repository of sexism, racism, and homophobia. Instead, it is <u>an active, signifying force</u>; and <u>agent in its own terms</u>; a realm of multiple, inter- and intra-active cultures. (Alaimo and Hekman, "Introduction" 12)

### ② 内的-活動、エージェンシー、マテリアル的-言説的実践、エージェント的リアリズム

Intra-action signifies the mutual constitution of entangled agencies. That is, in contrast to the usual 'interaction,' which assumes that there are separate individual agencies that precede their interaction, the notion of intra-action recognizes that distinct agencies do not precede, but rather emerge through, intra-action. (Barad, *Meeting* 33)

Crucially, agency is a matter of intra-acting; it is an enactment, not something that someone or something has. It cannot be designated as an attribute of subjects or objects (as they do not preexist as such). It is not an attribute whatsoever. Agency is "doing" or "being" in its intra-acting. It is the enactment of iterative changes to particular practices—iterative reconfigurings of topological manifolds of spacetime-matter relations—through the dynamics of intra-activity. (Barad, *Meeting* 178)

In summary, the universe is agential intra-activity in its becoming. The primary ontological units are <u>not "things" but</u> <u>phenomena</u>—dynamic topological reconfigurings/entanglements/relationalites/(re)articulations. And the primary semantic units are <u>not "words" but material-discursive practices</u> through boundaries are constituted. This dynamism is agency. Agency is not an attribute but the ongoing reconfigurings of the world. On the basis of this <u>performative</u> <u>metaphysics</u>, in the next section I propose a posthumanist refiguration of the nature of materiality and discursivity and the relationship between them, and a <u>posthumanist account of performativity</u> (Barad, "Posthumanist Performativity" 135–36)

On an agential realist account, matter does not refer to a fixed substance; rather, <u>matter is substance in its intra-active</u> <u>becoming—not a thing, but a doing, a congealing of agency.</u> Matter is a stabilizing and destabilizing process of iterative intra-activity. Phenomena—the smallest material units (relational "atoms")—come to matter through this process of ongoing intra-activity. (Barad, "Posthumanist Performativity" 139)

# ③ 表象主義からパフォーマティヴィティへ、ポストヒューマニズム

All bodies, not merely "human" bodies, come to matter through the world's iterative intra-activity—its <u>performativity</u>....Bodies are not objects with inherent boundaries and properties; they are material-discursive phenomena. (Barad, "Posthumanist Performativity" 141)

Agential realism is an epistemological, ontological, and ethical framework that makes explicit the integral nature of these concerns. This framework provides <u>a posthumanist performative account</u> of technoscientific ad other naturalcultural practices. By "posthumanist" I mean to signal the crucial recognition that n<u>onhumans play an important role in naturalcultural practices</u>, including everyday social practices, scientific practices, and practices that do not include humans. But also, beyond this, <u>my use of "posthumanism" marks a refusal to take the distinction between 'human' and 'nonhuman' for granted, and to found analyses on this presumably fixed and inherent set of categories. (Barad, *Meeting* 32).</u>

#### ④「物語られる物質」

In other words, <u>materiality is discursive</u> (i.e., material phenomena are inseparable from the apparatuses of bodily production: matter emerges out of and includes as part of its being the ongoing reconfiguring of boundaries), just as discursive practices are always already material (i.e., they are ongoing material (re)configurings of the world). <u>Discursive</u> practices and material phenomena do not stand in a relation of externality to one another; rather, the material and the

discursive are mutually implicated in the dynamics of intra-activity. (Barad, "Posthumanist Performativity" 140)

• a 'storied matter" (Iovino, "Steps to a Material Ecocriitcism" 136)

- · Haraway, "Otherworldly Conversations"
- ⑤ 環境政治・環境保護思想への影響力

Tracing the traffic in toxins involves scientific/economic/political/ethical analyses of realms and interest groups heretofore imagined separately, for example, those of health, medicine, occupational safety, disability rights, and environmental justice, as well as "traditional" environmentalisms devoted to the welfare of wild creatures. The same material substance, in this case, a particular toxin such as mercury or dioxin, may affect the workers who produce it, the neighborhood in which it is produced, the domesticated and wild animals that ingest it, and the humans who ingest the animals who have ingested it. Beginning with material substances rather than already constituted social groups may, in fact, allow for the formation of unexpected political coalitions and alliances. (Alaimo and Hekman, "Introduction" 9)

### 5. マテリアル・エコクリティシズム

## ① マテリアル・フェミニズム・新マテリアリズムのエコクリティシズムへの貢献

From a perspective that embraces ontological, socio-ecological, and scientific stances, <u>Material Feminisms</u> emphasizes the power of matter to build dynamics of meaning in and across bodies, thus paving the way to a new dimension of <u>ecocriticism</u>. This new, "material" ecocriticism could trace narratives of matter not only as they are re-created by literature and other cultural forms, but also as they emerge in physical configurations, those "vicously porous" interlacements of flesh and symbolic imagination. (Iovino, "Steps to a Material Ecocriticism" 136)

If matter is agentic, and capable of producing its own meanings, every material configuration, from bodies to their contexts of living, is "telling," and therefore can be the object of a critical analysis aimed at discovering its stories, its material and discursive interplays, its place in a "choreography of becoming" (Coole and Frost 10). (Iovino and Oppermann, "Material Ecocriticism" 79)

③ 解釈の二方法

Material ecocriticism proposes basically two ways of interpreting the agency of matter. The first one focuses on <u>the way</u> <u>matter's (or nature's nonhuman agentic capacities are described and represented in narrative texts (literary, cultural, visual);</u> the second way focuses on <u>matter's "narrative" power of creating configurations of meanings and substances</u>, which enter with human lives into a field of co-emerging interactions. In this latter case, <u>matter itself becomes a text</u> where dynamics of "diffuse" agency and non-linear causality are inscribed and produced. (Iovino and Oppermann, "Material Ecocriticism" 79-80)

④ It-Narratives

They narrate their stories, and interestingly they do so not to human readers but to their fellow "things." …This is a palpable narrative instance of how matter and meaning can enter into a play of signification to produce intra-active relations between the human and the nonhuman, subject and object. (Iovino and Oppermann, "Material Ecociriticism" 82)

In the context of material ecocriticism, the humanization of things, places, natural elements, nonhuman animals, is not necessarily the sign of an anthropocentric and hierarchical vision but can be a narrative expedient intended to stress the agentic power of matter and the horizontality of its elements. If conceived in this critical perspective, anthropomorphizing representations can reveal similarities and symmetries between the human and the nonhuman. Thus, instead of stressing categorical divides, anthropomorphism potentially "works against anthropocentrism" (Bennett,

Vivrant 120). (Iovino and Oppermann, "Material Ecociriticism" 82)

⑤ ポストヒューマニスト的関心

It[material ecocriticism] turns our attention toward issues of embodiment and corporeality, and the agency of the nonhuman (animals, machines, environments)—and perhaps most importantly, to <u>posthumanist concerns of things</u> <u>outside of human control and language</u>, like other organisms, such as viruses and bacteria, that c0-constitute our existence. <u>It analyzes, in cultural and literary texts, how we intra-act with the world and the world of discourse</u>. (Iovino and Oppermann, "Theorizing Material Ecocriticism" 469)

⑥ マテリアル・エコクリティシズムの基本的概念

All these ideas—a distributive vision of agency, the emergent nature of the world's phenomena, the awareness that we inhabit a dimension crisscrossed by vibrant force that hybridize human and nonhuman matters, and finally the persuasion that matter and meaning constitute the fabric of our stories world—are the basic premises of material ecocriticism. (Iovino and Oppermann, "Introduction" 5)

⑦「回折的」読み

Diffraction is a material-discursive phenomenon that challenges the presumed inherent separability of subject and object, nature and culture, fact and value, human and nonhuman, organic and inorganic, epistemology and ontology, materiality and discursivity. Diffraction marks the limits of the determinacy and permanency of boundaries. One of the crucial lessons we have learned is that agential cuts cut things together and apart. *Diffraction* is *a matter of differential entanglements*. *Diffraction* is *not merely about differences, and certainly not differences in any absolute sense, but about the entangled nature of differences that matter*. This is the deep significance of a diffraction pattern. *Diffraction is a matter Diffraction is a matter Diffraction a matter Diffraction a matter*. This is the deep significance of a differences. *Diffraction a matter Diffraction a matter Diffraction* 

One of the basic insights of material ecocriticism consists in turning this "diffractive" reading into an interpretive methodology to be applied in the fields of literary and cultural studies and to conceive texual interpretation as a "practice of entanglement." Reading the discursive and the material, the cultural and the natural *diffractively*, not in separation, means reading through one another. Instead of concentrating on texts and seeing how they "reflect" the world's <u>phenomena</u>—natural life or a society's cultural practices—<u>such an interpretation reads worlds and text as an agentic entanglement.</u> This involves a reconceptualization of both the idea of text (as distinct from other nontexual material formations) and the idea of world (as "the outside of text"). According to this vision, text and world can be read as "circulating references," the same way that nature and culture can be *read and thought* through one another in laboratories, gender politics, or hybrid collectives of humans and nonhumans. In all the fields of life, the materiality of beings and of substances that support their existence is deeply related to the ways this materiality is conceptualized and discursively formulated. Therefore, instead of transforming "nature" into an endless series of interpretations, <u>the</u> "diffractive" method allows us to actively participate in a creative process in which material levels and levels of meanings emerge together, contributing to the world's becoming a web teeing with collective stories. (Iovino and Oppermann, "Introduction" 9-10)

## 6. フェミニスト・エコクリティシズム

Greta Gaard, Simon C. Estok, and Serpil Oppermann, eds., International Perspectives in Feminist Ecocriticism (2013)

I define feminist ecocriticism as an ecocritical theory and practice that productively incorporates the material turn in corporeal feminism, animal studies, transgender theory, science studies, women's global eco-activism for sustainable life, environmental justice, care ethics, sexual and interspecies justice, environmental health, and queer ecologies....

Feminist ecocriticism is also a form of literary criticism that examines these issues in literary texts....It is *feminist*, because it is concerned with the issues of embodied gendering in discursive and material practices, agencies, sexual and interspecies justice, and queer animal morphology in socio-material and ecological contexts that entail feminist arguments alongside mainstream posthumanist ones. (Oppermann, "Feminist Ecocriticism" 30-31)

#### Works Cited

- Abram, David. Becoming Animal: An Earthly Cosmology. New York: Vintage, 2010.
- Adamson, Joni, and Scott Slovic. "Guest Editors' Introduction: The Shoulders We Stand On: An Introduction to Ethnicity and Ecocriticism." *MELUS: Multi-Ethnic Literature of the U.S.* 34. 2 (Summer 2009): 5-24.
- Alaimo, Stacy. Bodily Natures: Science, Environment, and the Material Self. Bloomington: India UP, 2010.
- ---. "Trans-Corporeal Feminisms and the Ethical Space of Nature." Alaimo and Hekman, Material Feminism 237-64.
- Alaimo, Stacy, and Susan Hekman. "Introduction: Emerging Models of Materiality in Feminist Theory." Alaimo and Hekman, *Material Feminism* 1-19.
- ---, eds. Material Feminisms. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana UP, 2008.
- Barad, Karen. *Meeting the Universe Halfway: Quantum Physics and the entanglement of Matter and Meaning*. Durham, N.C.: Duke UP, 2007.
- ---. "Posthumanist Performativity: Toward an Understanding of How Matter Comes to Matter." Alaimo and Heckman, Material Feminism 120-54.
- Bennett, Jane. Vibrant Matter: The Political Ecology of Things. Durham: Duke UP, 2010.
- Butler, Judith. *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*. New York: Routledge, 1990. バトラー,ジュ ディス『ジェンダー・トラブル—フェミニズムとアイデンティティの攪乱』 竹村和子訳. 1999.
- Caldecott, Leonie, and Stephanie Leland, eds. *Reclaim the Earth: Women Speak Out for Life on Earth.* London: Women's Press, 1983.
- Coole, Diana, and Samantha Frost. "Introducing the New Materialisms." Coole and Frost 1-14.
- ---, eds. New Materialisms: Ontology, Agency, and Politics. Durham: Duke UP, 2010.
- Daly, Mary. Gyn/Ecology: The Meta-Ethics of Radical Feminism. Boston: Beacon Press, 1978.
- Diamond, Irene, and Gloria Feman Orenstein. Introduction. *Reweaving the World: The Emergence of Ecofeminism*. Ed. Diamond and Orenstein. San Francisco: Sierra Club Books, 1990. ix-xv. ダイアモンド,アイリーン,グロリ ア・フェマン・オレンスタイン編『世界を織りなおす—エコフェミニズムの開花』 奥田 暁子・近藤 和 子 訳.學藝書林,1994.
- Gaard, Greta, Simon C. Estok, and Serpil Oppermann, eds. *International Perspectives in Feminist Ecocriticism*. New York and London: Routledge, 2013.
- Gaard, Greta. "Living Interconnections with Animals and Nature." *Ecofeminism: Women, Animals, Nature.* Ed. Gaard. Philadelphia: Temple UP, 1993. 1-12.
- Griffin, Susan. Woman and Nature: The Roaring Inside Her. New York: Harper and Row, 1978.
- Haraway, Donna. *Simians, Cyborgs, and Women: The Reinvention of Nature*. London: Free Association Books, 1991. ハラウェイ,ダナ『猿と女とサイボーグ—自然の再発明』高橋さきの訳.青土社、2000.
- ---. "Otherworldly Conversations, Terrain Topics, Local Terms." Alaimo and Hekman, Material Feminisms 157-87.

- Hekman, Susan. "Constructing the Ballast: An Ontology for Feminism." Alaimo and Hekman, *Material Feminisms* 85-119.
- Hennessy, Rosemary, and Chrys Ingraham, eds. *Materialist Feminism: A Reader in Class, Difference, and Women's Lives*. New York and London: Routledge, 1997.
- Iovino, Serenella. "Steps to a Material Ecocriticism: The Recent Literature about the 'New Materialisms' and Its Implications for Ecocritical Theory." Rev. of Stacy Alaimo and Susan Hekman, eds., *Material Feminisms* (2008); Stacy Alaimo, *Bodily Natures: Science, Environment, and the Material Self* (2010); Jane Bennett, *Vibrant Matter: A Political Ecology of Things* (2010); David Abrams, *Becoming Animal* (2010). *Ecozon*(a).1(2012): 134-45.
- Iovino, Serenella, and Serpil Oppermann. "Introduction: Stories Come to Matter." Iovino and Oppermann, *Material Ecocriticism* 1-17.
- ---, eds. Material Ecocriticism. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana UP, 2014.
- ---. "Material Ecocriticism: Materiality, Agency, and Models of Narrativity." Ecozon@3.1(2012): 75-91.
- ---. "Theorizing Material Ecocriticism: A Diptych." ISLE 19.3 (Summer 2012): 448-75.
- King, Ynestra. "The Ecology of Feminism and the Feminism of Ecology." Plant 18-28.
- Merchant, Carolyn. *The Death of Nature: Women, Ecology, and the Scientific Revolution*. New York: Harper & Row, 1980.
- Murphy, Patrick D. "Ecofeminism and Postmodernism: Agency, Transformation, and Future Possibilities." NWSA Journal 9.3, Women, Ecology, and the Environment (Autumn, 1997): 41-59.
- ---. Literature, Nature, and Other: Ecofeminist Critiques. Albany: State U of New York P, 1995.
- Oppermann, Serpil. "Feminist Ecocriticism: A Postthumanist Directon in Ecocritical Trajectory." Gaard, Estok, and Oppermann, 19-36.
- Penley, Constance, and Andrew Ross. "Cyborgs at Large: Interview with Donna Haraway." *Technoculture*. Ed. Penley and Ross. Minneapolis: U of Minnesota, P, 1991. 1-20.
- Plant, Judith, ed. Healing the Wounds: The Promise of Ecofeminism. Philadelphia: New Society, 1989.
- Phillips, Dana, and Heather I. Sullivan. "Material Ecocriitcism: Dirt, Waste, Bodies, Food, and other Matter." *ISLE* 19.3 (Summer 2012): 445-47.
- Slovic, Scott. Editor's Note. ISLE 19.4 (2012).
- ----. "The Third Wave of Ecocriticism: North American Reflections on the Current Phase of the Discipline." *Ecozon*@ 1.1 (2010): 4-10.
- Sullivan, Rebecca. Rev. of *Materialist Feminism: A Reader in Class, Difference, and Women's Lives. Canadian Journal of Communication* 24.3 (1999). <a href="http://www.cjc-online.ca/index.php/journal/article/view/1118/1024">http://www.cjc-online.ca/index.php/journal/article/view/1118/1024</a>>.

Diffraction	Reflection
diffraction pattern	mirror image
marking differences from within	reflection of objects held at
and as part of an entangled state	a distance
differences, relationalities	sameness, mimesis
objectivity is about	objectivity is about reflections,
taking account of marks	copies that are homologous to
on bodies, that is, the	originals, authentic,
differences materialized,	free of distortion
the differences that matter	
diffractive methodology	reflexivity
performativity	representationalism
subject and object do not	preexisting determinate
preexist as such, but emerge	boundary between subject
through intra-actions	and object
entangled ontology	separate entities
material-discursive phenomena	words and things
onto-epistem-ology	ontology   epistemology binary
knowing is a material practice	knowledge is true beliefs
of engagement as part of the world	concerning reflections
in its differential becoming	from a distance
	knower   known binary
	seeing/observing/knowing
	from afar
intra-acting within and as part of	interacting of separate entities
differences emerge within phenomena	inside/outside
agential separability	absolute separation
real material differences	no difference
but without absolute separation	interior/exterior
diffraction/difference pattern	words mirror things
intra-acting entangled	social   natural binary
states of nature cultures	nature   culture binary
about making a difference in the world	about representations
about taking responsibility for	about finding accurate
the fact that our practices matter;	representations
the world is materialized	about the gaze from afar
differently through different	
practices (contingent ontology)	

phenomena are objective referents accountability to marks	things are objective referents accountability entails
on bodies	finding an authentic
accountability and responsibility	mirror representation
taking account of differences that matter	of separate things
ethico-onto-epistem-ology	ethics   ontology   epistemology
ethics, ontology, epistemology not separable	separate fields of study
reading through (the diffraction grating)	reading against (some fixed target/mirror)
transdisciplinary engagement	privilege one discipline
attend to the fact that boundary	read other(s) against it
production between disciplines	
is itself a material-discursive practice;	
how do these practices matter?	
subject, object contingent, not fixed	subject   object fixed
respectful engagement that attends to	reify, simplify, make
detailed patterns of thinking of each;	the other into a separate object
fine-grained details matter	less attentive to and able
	to resolve important
	details, dynamics,
	how boundaries are made
Summary	
accounting for how practices matter	reflecting on representations

Karen Barad, Meeting the Universe Halfway (Duke UP, 2007), 89-90.